Assessment and recommendations

Growth
performance
improved over
the 1990s, but
public finances
lack strength and
the catching-up
process has
stalled

Portugal has the lowest per capita income in the euro area and until the recent enlargement, it also had the lowest in the EU. Brisk growth in the last years of the 20th century led to some convergence with living standards in the more advanced EU countries, largely thanks to the reforms that began some 15 to 20 years ago. Liberalisation of the financial sector, far-reaching privatisation and deregulation, high investment and improved human capital delivered notable results. Falling real and nominal interest rates in the run-up to euro entry fuelled private sector demand and weakened the government's incentives to control primary spending. This also led to the build up of major imbalances, including a large external deficit and high household and corporate indebtedness. The structural budget deficit was also allowed to widen in the late 1990s, forcing the authorities to undertake a drastic corrective programme to reduce the excessive budget deficit during the economic slowdown. The adjustment process in the private sector, compounded by public sector retrenchment and a depressed international environment, led to a protracted period of weak activity for three years running, with real GDP actually falling in 2003. The recovery in activity is likely to be slow. Recent strong cyclical movements make it difficult to estimate potential GDP growth accurately, but it is likely that actual GDP will remain below potential for some years, postponing the catching-up process.

The priorities are to spur potential growth...

Portugal's key medium-term challenge is to raise income levels. Since employment rates are already high (and unemployment low) this will require sustained increases in labour and total factor productivity. Policies are required that enhance human capital, facilitate labour mobility, intensify

the use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT), raise managerial efficiency and create a favourable climate for private investment.

... and to ensure sustained fiscal discipline

Portugal also needs to address the chronic problem – recently in a more acute phase - of weak public finances to ensure that the catchingup process will not be jeopardised by fiscal difficulties. Fiscal consolidation in the upswing would have obviated the need for procyclical policies in the downswing. More fundamentally, severe difficulties lie on the spending side: rapid growth of primary spending over more than a decade has put Portugal among higher-spending countries, considering its income level, while the cost-effectiveness of service provision has been doubtful. Getting spending under better control. including via a more efficient public sector, would permit more resources to go to the development needs of Portugal. The ongoing reform in the health sector is a good example of the strategy to improve the quality of public services and meet the population needs, while seeking to limit pressures on public expenditure over the medium-term. Thus the government's focus on curbing the fiscal deficit, engaging in public sector reforms and raising productivity growth is welcome

To raise productivity growth and allow catching up in living standards, more reforms are needed

There is indeed considerable scope to accelerate the convergence process through raising productivity, and current policy strategies recognise this. The economy's trade specialisation has typically been in low-skill labour-intensive sectors, in which it faces rising competition from some of the new EU members, where wages are lower and whose labour forces are generally higher-skilled, and from other low-wage countries outside the OECD. The Portuguese productive sector is responding to the shift in relative prices, and to enjoy durably stronger growth, Portugal needs to continue to move away from traditional labour-intensive low value-added products. The most promising strategy to address the catching-up challenge is to:

- raise the skills of the Portuguese workforce, to accelerate the shift towards higher value-added and more competitive products;
- ease restrictive employment protection legislation for established workers, which creates labour market segmentation, hinders mobility and restrains technological and managerial innovation;

- intensify the use of Information and Communication Technology;
- raise public awareness of the advantages of competition, building on the new Competition Law and Authority;
- create an environment where the private sector invests and innovates, and where firms are encouraged to expand if they are successful.

Government programmes to address these issues are at various stages of development. The key is to carry through and deepen these reform programmes and ensure effective implementation.

The level of human capital is still very low

Despite a big improvement in the past decade, Portugal still ranks close to the bottom of the OECD in terms of educational attainment of the population and student performance. Value for money in the schooling system is poor, as evidenced by the combination of below-average student performance with a close to average level of spending per student. The acquisition of higher skills, in school or on the job, would make the labour force more adaptable; it would also foster the use of new technologies and innovation in production processes and management. More educated workers would be able to move to higher productivity jobs or to positions where their productivity can grow more rapidly over time.

Reforms to improve the education system require swift and continuous implementation...

Aware of the urgent need to further raise the quality of education services, reforms have been undertaken: i) measures have been launched at all levels of formal schooling, modernising the curricula and introducing flexibility, although the Framework Law setting the principles for the reform of compulsory schooling was still being legislated in mid-2004; ii) a new focus is put on professional schooling and technical education; iii) changes are being made to the operating and financing of tertiary education; iv) rationalisation of the network of schools has started with the regrouping of very small schools. The strategy to push forward the transformation of Portugal into a knowledge-based economy and to improve the cost-effectiveness of the education system seems broadly adequate. Measures starting to be implemented, such as systematic evaluations of schools and teachers and allowing universities to set their fees and recruitment requirements more freely, are promising.

Educational reforms will be more effective when the Framework Law for compulsory education is approved and implemented throughout the education system.

... and more efforts are needed to enhance the scale and quality of adult training Revamping of vocational training and lifelong learning is envisaged. Some of the framework conditions are being developed, such as the national certification system and evaluation tools. But plans to make recurrent education effective and promote lifelong learning are at a more preliminary stage. Ongoing discussions with social partners are promising. They should lead to policy measures; thereafter, swift implementation and close monitoring of results will be key, given the importance of upskilling the existing workforce.

The labour market performs rather well, but obstacles to job mobility should be reduced

Portugal's labour market performs rather well, coping with structural changes without a durable increase in the unemployment rate, while employment rates are higher than the European average, especially for groups typically under-represented in the labour force. This has been achieved through flexible real wage adjustment and the expansion of atypical contracts. Even so, labour mobility is low, in a context of rather restrictive employment protection legislation (EPL). The labour market is segmented: established workers who enjoy a high level of protection coexist with self employed and workers on fixed-term contracts, and informality is pervasive in certain activities. The reform to the labour legislation, which has been applied since the end of 2003, should make the labour market more responsive to both cyclical and structural forces: i) it should enhance the responsiveness of wage settlements to productivity and skill differentials across economic sectors: ii) it extends the possibility of using fixed-term contracts under certain conditions: and iii) it allows better control of absenteeism and fraudulent claims to sick leave. However, the reform does not fully address the need to ease general job protection legislation. This aspect should be put back on the reform agenda, as it would help to strike a better balance between job security and increased labour mobility. It would also facilitate hiring under permanent contracts and be conducive to higher productivity growth.

Much remains to be done to intensify the penetration of ICT and innovation... Despite progress made in ICT access and use, Portugal is not keeping up with the rapid development of the Information Society in many other OECD countries. To some extent, measures such as upgrading human skills in the Portuguese working-age population at large and facilitating workers' mobility in the job market, will contribute to closing the gap. Complementary actions are probably still needed. Among these, a key element would be to reduce users' costs in the telecommunication market, by enhancing competition there. Efforts to modernise management and train entrepreneurs would also contribute.

... and efforts should continue to improve the climate for doing business and investing

Portugal's investment rate is relatively high, reflecting large inflows of EU structural funds and FDI over many years. There is a very dynamic private sector which operates in an open and competitive environment. The cost of doing business, reflecting administrative procedures, licensing, lack of transparency and predictability of tax and other regulatory obligations, was often perceived as being high (as illustrated by various indicators developed at the OECD). Administrative procedures for creating new businesses have been streamlined. However, the complexity of business taxation and regulation continue to limit private investment, inhibit entry of new firms, discourage existing profitable firms from expanding and permit unprofitable firms to survive through recourse to informal activities and non-compliance with tax obligations and regulations. Measures were introduced, starting in 2002, as part of the broad-based "Productivity and Growth Programme" to improve the business climate. In particular:

- Tax and administrative simplification is continuing, which is appropriate.
- A new incentive regime was launched in mid-2003 to foster capital formation, including through targeted tax breaks
- The reform of the Bankruptcy Law, which was urgently needed, has been approved and should now be speedily be implemented. The antiquated legal system acted as a deterrent to adequate restructuring of businesses in trouble.

The government's strategic intervention to foster investment includes commendable initiatives, for instance integrating all administrative procedures in a single agency and encouraging venture capital. However, the government should also take steps to further reduce the number of administrative procedures, and refrain from distorting market forces through tax incentives and subsidies. Helping a sector or a firm would set an unhelpful precedent and it would run against efforts made over past years to improve the allocation of resources by ensuring a level-playing field.

Recent steps to promote effective competition are promising: continued efforts are required Portugal has made key advances in 2003 to promote competition, with the creation of an independent and financially autonomous Competition Authority and the approval of a new Competition Law. However, effective competition is still low in certain sectors, particularly in the network industries where prices for specific services or consumers remain relatively high.

- While furthering the process of privatization, the state should be careful to refrain from past practices, such as retaining special voting rights in companies operating in "strategic sectors", which risks distorting or discouraging private investment to the detriment of consumers and the efficiency of the economy.
- The creation of the Iberian Electricity Market (MIBEL), still to be implemented, is expected to improve capacity and efficiency of the electricity sector. In preparation, Portugal has further opened its retail market for electricity. Competition issues are being examined in the European Commission to ensure that the structure of the new market be conducive to effective competition and secure reliable supply of electricity at low prices for Portuguese industry and households over the medium to long-term.
- The lack of competition and concomitant high prices in some fixed telecommunication services, where the incumbent retains market power, continues to require forceful action from the Competition Authority and the sector's regulator, in tandem.

Fiscal consolidation since 2002 has been sizeable Because the cyclically-adjusted budget position was allowed to deteriorate during the late 1990s upturn, Portugal was confronted with the need to undertake fiscal retrenchment in the downturn, after the deficit exceeded the 3 per

cent limit by a wide margin. Reducing the budget deficit and ensuring sustainability of public finances over the longerterm has been the overriding policy priority since 2002, despite a weak external and domestic economic environment. The government's strategy over the past two years has included spending cuts and freezes and sizeable one-off operations, in combination with more in-depth reforms to put public finances on a sustainable basis over the longer run. The areas for reform include: public administration, the health care sector and education services and rules governing fiscal relations with sub-central governments (and autonomous funds). The government's two-pronged strategy seems appropriate. The deficit was maintained below 3 per cent in 2002 and 2003 despite the cyclical weakness. Achieving quick results through emergency cuts and one-off measures with limited demand effects has given more time for the implementation of necessary in-depth measures and for reaping the results in terms of spending control.

The medium-term deficit reduction programme is appropriate but not easy to achieve

The authorities' 2004-07 Stability Programme foresees an average annual reduction of the structural budget deficit of about ½ percentage point of GDP per year, mainly achieved through expenditure side adjustments, while the corporate income tax rate is cut by 5 percentage points in 2004 and again in 2006. This approach is in line with earlier OECD recommendations. The groundwork has been laid for long-lasting reforms with the approval of important legislation: closing down government agencies, re-allocating civil servants; rationalising the school network; raising private tuition fees in universities; promoting the use of generic pharmaceuticals; incorporating some hospitals and creating public-private partnerships in others. However, meeting the medium-term targets will not be an easy task.

• First, achieving the 2004 deficit target of 2.9 per cent of GDP is likely to require more one-off measures than budgeted. The macroeconomic scenario underlying the budget is prudent, but revenue projections that assume increased compliance appear rather optimistic. According to OECD estimates, which also envisage some slippage in current expenditure, the deficit could be about 1 percentage point higher than budgeted.

 Second, achieving a steady reduction of the structural deficit implies forceful implementation of the approved structural reforms. But there seems to have been delays in the implementation of the reforms, judging from the heavy reliance of the 2004 budget on spending freezes and one-off measures.

Implementation of the public administration reform needs to be accelerated...

Implementation needs to be accelerated, especially in some areas of public administration reform. Most of the legislation to improve human resource management has already been approved: a new organisational model for central administration, a new framework for public institutes, a new status for managers imposing performance requirements and reinforcing managerial autonomy and accountability. There have already been some achievements in terms of closure or merger of public institutes and schools and restructuring has started in two ministries. However, implementation needs to be stepped up as enhanced effectiveness of the public administration would be a key factor in achieving the intended results in many other reform areas. The "employment pool", created to encourage mobility of civil servants, has yet to be used on a significant scale. The legislation introducing individual contracts in the public sector, to give more flexibility to human resource management, has been approved. It is too early to judge the eventual success of these reforms, but success is crucial because public sector employment is recognised as being excessively large relative to the services provided in many areas, while staff mobility is very low.

... and to be complemented by a strong pension reform Once fully and effectively implemented, in-depth reforms in education, health care and the public administration are likely to improve cost-effectiveness in the public sector and spending control. However they will be insufficient to meet ageing-related pressures on public finances in the longer run.

Official simulations suggest that the expected population ageing will increase public expenditure on pensions by 2.6 percentage points of GDP by 2020. The pension system for private workers will be in deficit by 2015, thereafter financed for a further 10-15 years by the pension trust fund. The generous public sector pension regime is already in deficit.

- The pension reform initiated a few years ago with the definition of a new benefit formula for disability and old-age pensions for private sector workers will have only a minor impact on spending.
- The legislation on a second-pillar complementary regime envisaged in the framework law is still in preparation.
- Regarding the public sector regime, the changes introduced to the benefit formula in 2004 will not suffice to cope with pressures coming from the ageing population.

Therefore, a more radical reform of both the public and private employees' pension schemes is imperative. A number of options could be considered, including: incentives to raise the effective age of retirement; reducing the annual accrual rate; limiting indexation of standard pensions to inflation rather than wage developments; increasing the (low) effective rate of taxation of pension incomes; and adjusting replacement rates for changes in life expectancy [of pension cohorts]. Several of these options would probably need to be combined to significantly improve the sustainability of the pension systems.

A reform
of the health care
system has been
launched
to control cost
and improve
performance...

In another area, the comprehensive reform to increase efficiency of the health care system launched in 2002 should help put public finances on a sounder medium-term path. The reform has two main aims: to deliver better-quality public health services than at present but at no higher cost; and to reduce the underlying growth rate of public health-care spending over the medium term. New legislation has been approved over the last two years, including: the separation of the functions of regulation, financing and provision of health care services; setting up new models of financing for providers, which impose harder budget constraints; the introduction of incentives towards productivity, management and quality improvements in both primary health care centres and hospitals; the possibility for the private sector to play a larger role in service provision; and the promotion of generic drugs. In contrast to previous attempts of gradual reforms, which were never fully implemented, the strategy has been to create a big bang in the health sector, making reform efforts essentially irreversible.

... addressing most of the sector's weaknesses

The reform is an important step forward. It addresses the most serious weaknesses of the system identified in earlier OECD *Economic Surveys*, in particular:

- It places public providers under pressure to provide cost-effective services via changes in the way they are managed (especially with regard to organisation, budget, staff remuneration and monitoring of results).
- More than one-third of public hospitals (34, mostly medium-sized) have been incorporated. Higher production and some productivity gains seem to have been achieved already.
- A specific programme to reduce waiting lists addresses a key source of patients' dissatisfaction and of inequitable access to health care. First results show a significant reduction in waiting time, partially obscured by a concomitant increase in demand for treatment.
- The progressive strengthening of the long-term care network, which is relatively under-developed in Portugal, should help reduce the overcrowding of hospitals by (ageing) patients requiring long-term care rather than acute health care.
- The new pharmaceutical policy designed to curb expenditure (which had been growing at double digit rates over the last decade), by putting pressure on the pharmaceutical industry to reduce prices and by increasing cost sharing, has had an immediate impact. Spending decelerated in 2003 and the generic market share more than tripled, to over 6.5 per cent by early 2004, though still low in international comparison.

Implementation of this wideranging reform programme requires flanking measures... Now that most legislation has been approved, the key challenges lie in its implementation and monitoring, and in consolidating recent achievements. Although short-term positive results may be easy to reach, sustained improvements will be more difficult to achieve. The reform strategy should thus be strengthened. Dissemination of information about the reform process and progress needs to be improved in order to help garner public support, and, as importantly, to facilitate external assessment of results and identify areas where corrective actions are necessary. Efforts are also needed to

ensure that progress in efficiency is followed by improvements in quality of care and health outcomes, where Portugal still lags more advanced EU countries. This calls for putting more emphasis on quality in the benchmarking of health institutions and putting in place mechanisms to avoid adverse selection practices. The regional health administrations also need to be modernised to fulfil the new tasks as purchasers of health care assigned to them in the reform. The introduction of a new independent regulatory body is an important step in the reform process. Lastly, the reform needs to be better integrated in a medium-term strategy. The National Health Plan and the programmes it contains are a possible vehicle for this but, at this stage, the articulation between the ongoing reform and this 10-year plan is not yet clear.

... and more will have to be done to increase efficiency further and improve health status The reform also needs to be completed by additional measures to release its full effects. In particular, to further increase efficiency and reduce current pressures on costs, the reform should:

- seek more actively the integration of the various provider networks (primary care, hospitals, long-term care) so as to reduce wasteful duplication of acts and improve the quality of follow-up of patients across the system;
- put in place additional measures to tackle excessive expenditure, such as assessments of new technologies before they are generalised in public health care, measures to curb hospitals' expenditure on pharmaceuticals and additional measures to consolidate the recent slowdown of spending on drugs sold in pharmacies;
- consider measures to limit excessive demand for health services, for instance by increasing co-payments (with safeguards to promote equity of access) and rationalising reimbursements so as to avoid duplication of care and limit excessive requests for second or third opinions:
- enhance medical prevention and early detection of illnesses, which tend to improve health outcomes and to reduce costs of health care associated with late detection:
- consider other actions which could almost certainly improve the population's health status, with very little impact on public finances, for instance running information campaigns on the benefits of "healthy life-styles" and road security.

Summing up

The recent downturn has been severe and the economic recovery is slow. Despite continuing fiscal consolidation efforts, keeping the budget deficit below 3 per cent in 2004 will not be easy. Forceful implementation of indepth reforms initiated in the public administration, the health care sector and education services is required to improve spending control and deliver better outcomes. In addition, a strong pension reform is imperative to put the private and public pension systems on a financially sustainable path. The key medium-term challenge for Portugal is to close the income gap with more advanced OECD countries. A broad-based strategy has been launched to increase labour and total factor productivity. A sine qua non for its success is to ensure effective implementation and sustain the momentum of reform over the longer term.

Table of contents

Assessment and recommendations		
1.	Key challenges and issues Overview	21 21
	The fiscal challenge	23
	The catching-up challenge: lifting productivity growth	25
	Short to medium-term growth prospects	38
	Summing up Notes	43
		45 47
	Bibliography August Al. Background information to Chapter I	
	Annex 1.A1. Background information to Chapter 1	49
2.	Structural policies to lift Portugal's living standards	65
	A broad-based strategy to upgrade knowledge and skills	66
	Reforms to use the labour force effectively	77
	Promoting effective competition and moving forward in sectoral reform	81 85
	Improving the business environment Concluding remarks	91
	Notes	94
	Bibliography	100
3.		101
٦.	Fiscal consolidation in the short run	101
	Reforms have been launched to improve the quality and efficiency of public services	110
	Ensuring long-term sustainability of public finances	114
	Notes	122
	Bibliography	125
4.	The ongoing reform of the Health care system	127
4.		
	Overview of the system in the early 2000s Performance of the system	127 130
	The ongoing reform of the health care system	139
	Assessment and agenda for future reforms	156
	Notes	161
	Bibliography	168
	Annex 4.A1. Background information to Chapter 4	169

1.11.

Monetary conditions

Boxes		
1.1. 1 A1 1	Main strengths and weaknesses of the Portuguese economy The EU cohesion policy	22 63
2.1.	Reform of education and vocational training: ongoing measures	67
2.2.	Reform of adult training: measures announced	73
2.3.	On the informal sector and low productivity	86
2.4.	Implementing structural reform: an overview	92
3.1.	The 2001 slippage and the excessive deficit procedure	102
3.2.	Emergency policy measures to contain wage bill growth	104
3.3.	Social security under the 2000 Social Security Framework Law	117
4.1.	The three categories of public hospitals after the 2002 reform	147
4.2.	Summary of recommendations to strengthen the health care reform	160
Tables		
1.1.	Sources of growth in real GDP per capita: selected OECD countries	28
1.2.	Change in productivity induced by a change in product market regulation	41
	The proximate determinants of GDP per capita	50
	Panel A. Change in the trade specialisation of Portugal	52
	Panel B. Change in the trade specialisation of Czech Republic	53
	Panel C. Change in the trade specialisation of Hungary	54
	Panel D. Change in the trade specialisation of Poland	55
	Panel E. Change in the trade specialisation of the Slovak Republic	56
	Indicators of infrastructure, Panel A. Composite index of transport infrastructure	57
	Indicators of infrastructure, Panel B. Composite index of telecommunications infrastructure	58
	Indicators of infrastructure, Panel C. Composite index of electricity infrastructure	59
	Short-term projections	60
2.1.	Indicators on ICT application in education	68
3.1.	General government financial accounts	105
3.2.	Social security account: official projections	118
3.3.	The pension system for civil servants (CGA): official projections	120
4.1.	Categories of health spending	129
4.2.	Hospital indicators	144
4.3.	Some key results of the hospitals SA in 2003	148
4.4.	Reimbursement of pharmaceuticals Public expenditure on health care	151 172
	Regional health data	173
	Health employment indicators	173
4.A1.5.	nealth employment indicators	175
Figure		
1.1.	Budget balances, 1990-2004	24
1.2.	Per capita GDP trend growth	26
1.3.	Breaking down the income gap	27
1.4.	Trend productivity growth	29
1.5.	Educational attainment of the working-age population	30
1.6.	Student performance in selected countries	31 32
1.7.	Fixed investment rates Indicators of ICT investment and ICT expanditures	
1.8. 1.9.	Indicators of ICT investment and ICT expenditures Foreign direct investment	34 35
1.9.	Product market liberalisation	37
1.10.	i roduct market moetunoution	71

39

Table of contents 5

1.12.	Scope for raising participation rates	42
1.A1.1.	Standards of living in the OECD	50
1.A1.2.	Employment rate indicators	61
2.1.	Continuing vocational training (CVT) in selected OECD countries	71
2.2.	Internet indicators: an international comparison	75
2.3.	Types of employment	78
2.4.	Standardised unemployment rates in OECD countries	79
2.5.	Electricity prices in selected OECD countries	82
2.6.	Telephone charges in OECD countries 2000 and 2004	84
2.7.	Levels of compliance as perceived by firms	87
2.8.	Innovation indicators	89
3.1.	Contributions to fiscal consolidation 1995-2003	103
3.2.	Fiscal consolidation efforts	106
3.3.	Statutory corporate tax rates in OECD countries	109
3.4.	General government wage bill and employment in selected OECD countries	111
3.5.	Public administration employees	112
3.6.	Population by age cohorts	115
4.1.	Public expenditure on health care in 1990 and 2000	129
4.2.	Per capita health expenditure and per capita GDP	130
4.3.	Portugal health status	133
4.4.	Expenditure and health status in OECD countries	135
4.5.	Practising doctors and practising nurses	137
4.6.	Trends in acute care beds in selected OECD countries	138
4.7.	Resource use in health care supply in Portugal and selected OECD countries	139
4.8.	General practitioners and practising specialists	142
4.9.	Trends in average length of stay in acute care in selected OECD countries	145
4.10.	Market share of generics	152
4.11.	Pharmaceutical sales in OECD countries	153
4.A1.1.	The health care system in 1999	170
4.A1.2.	Health status	171
	The proportion of obese population is around OECD average	175
	Calories intake surged in the last two decades	176
	Alcohol consumption remains high	177
	The population does not exercise sufficiently	178
	Tobacco consumption is relatively low	179
4.A1.8.	Causes of death	180



From:

OECD Economic Surveys: Portugal 2004

Access the complete publication at:

https://doi.org/10.1787/eco_surveys-prt-2004-en

Please cite this chapter as:

OECD (2004), "Assessment and Recommendations", in *OECD Economic Surveys: Portugal 2004*, OECD Publishing, Paris.

DOI: https://doi.org/10.1787/eco_surveys-prt-2004-2-en

This work is published under the responsibility of the Secretary-General of the OECD. The opinions expressed and arguments employed herein do not necessarily reflect the official views of OECD member countries.

This document and any map included herein are without prejudice to the status of or sovereignty over any territory, to the delimitation of international frontiers and boundaries and to the name of any territory, city or area.

You can copy, download or print OECD content for your own use, and you can include excerpts from OECD publications, databases and multimedia products in your own documents, presentations, blogs, websites and teaching materials, provided that suitable acknowledgment of OECD as source and copyright owner is given. All requests for public or commercial use and translation rights should be submitted to rights@oecd.org. Requests for permission to photocopy portions of this material for public or commercial use shall be addressed directly to the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) at info@copyright.com or the Centre français d'exploitation du droit de copie (CFC) at contact@cfcopies.com.

