ISBN 978-92-64-04692-4
OECD Economic Surveys: South Africa
Economic Assessment
© OECD 2008

Executive summary

Mainstream economic policies have brought impressive economic performance, but remaining problems are still huge

The democratically elected government that came to power in 1994 inherited an economy wracked by long years of internal conflict and external sanctions. Against that backdrop, economic performance since 1994 has been impressive. In particular, the successive governments during that period have shown considerable prudence, refraining from resorting to economic populism in an effort to boost short-term growth. As a result, public finances were stabilised, inflation was brought down, foreign capital was attracted in growing amounts, and economic growth, after lagging for a time, improved. The awarding of the 2010 FIFA World Cup to South Africa is just one sign that South Africa is now seen as a stable, modern state, in many ways a model for the rest of the African continent. However, there have also been notable weaknesses in the economic record to date, especially as regards unemployment, inequality, and poverty. Social problems such as HIV/AIDS and crime have been prominent as well, and these twin scourges also have a strong negative economic impact. Indeed, there are strong bi-directional links between economic and social problems, as is shown by the recent attacks on immigrants, who are blamed for aggravating unemployment and downward pressure on wages. One challenge for the future will be to maintain the macroeconomic prudence which has fostered fiscal and external sustainability while dealing with these formidable problems. This will also make it easier to tackle more boldly some of the legacies of apartheid which are still holding back progress for many black South Africans. This is especially true as regards education, competition policy, and the functioning of labour markets. The in-depth chapters of this Assessment therefore focus on how to strengthen competition and improve labour market outcomes. Education is also discussed, though in somewhat less depth, in part because a separate OECD study of South Africa's education system is forthcoming.

Growth has improved, supported by rising terms of trade...

Although there was some initial improvement in growth performance after the stagnation of the last years of apartheid, income growth per capita for the first decade of the democratic era was modest, and South African living standards continued to diverge from the OECD average. While output per worker grew steadily, growth in the labour force far outstripped that of employment, pushing unemployment to extremely high levels. Investment increased slowly, and South Africa's export performance was weak, with a

steady decline in global market share. From 2004 onward economic growth picked up substantially, through improvements in the rate of increase of both employment and capital formation. An important spur to the growth acceleration was the surge in the prices of South Africa's main export commodities. The supply response in mining was actually muted, but on the demand side higher natural resource export receipts gave an impetus to domestic spending. Consumption has grown more quickly than output every year since 2004. Recently there also has been an increasing contribution to growth from investment, in part reflecting a ramping up of public infrastructure spending.

... and macroeconomic policies remain credible, although tested by current global economic conditions

The budget deficit, which exceeded 7% of GDP in 1993/94, was reduced progressively through both revenue measures and expenditure restraint, and for the last two years the budget has been in surplus. The turnaround in budgetary performance has brought the public debt burden down to moderate levels, which in turn has contributed to improved investor sentiment towards South African assets. That improvement was reflected in strong portfolio inflows and successive upgradings of South African's sovereign credit ratings. The medium-term budget plan calls for surpluses to continue, though this is recognised to be a cyclical phenomenon, as on a cyclically adjusted basis the budget has remained in deficit and is projected to remain so. As to monetary policy, the South African Reserve Bank (SARB) has, like the National Treasury, earned a reputation as a credible and competent agency. Its operational independence is constitutionally guaranteed, and it has established a broadly successful record under inflation targeting since 2002. The targeted measure of inflation declined from about 7% prior to the adoption of inflation targeting to just over 3% in early-2005, and expectations quickly converged to the SARB's target zone. When inflation subsequently began to turn up, the SARB repeatedly raised interest rates, 10 times in all since 2006. Nonetheless, inflation has continued to rise, and a combination of global and domestic economic circumstances are providing a stern test to monetary policy. South Africa is exposed to considerable inflationary pressures from surging food and energy prices, import price pass-through from the recent weakness of the rand, and electricity tariffs which are likely to rise rapidly this year and next. The SARB itself now expects inflation to remain above the target range until the second half of 2010.

Growth could be strengthened further, however...

The welcome acceleration of real GDP growth in the past few years has done little to improve South Africa's ranking relative to other middle-income countries, as faster growth has been a worldwide phenomenon; South Africa's growth rate still trails behind those of the most dynamic emerging economies. And while trend growth of total factor productivity also appears to have turned up, it is still only around average for a country of South Africa's per capita income level. Moreover, the faster rate of growth in the past four years has been accompanied by only a modest decline in unemployment, and the government's development strategy, the Accelerated and Shared Growth Initiative for South Africa (AsgiSA), foresees further increases in growth rates to an average of 6% a year

between 2010 and 2014 in order to achieve the objectives of halving unemployment and poverty.

... and needs to be more broadly based

Given that the development strategies articulated by the governments of the democratic era have been oriented to improving the lot of the historically disadvantaged majority black population, the most disappointing aspect of post-apartheid economic performance is the emergence and persistence of extreme levels of unemployment, particularly for less-skilled younger blacks, together with the continuation of widespread poverty and the widening of inequalities. The failure to bring unemployment down decisively is probably the greatest source of popular discontent about the government's economic policies, despite numerous successes, and it naturally leads to pressures to try more radical and activist solutions which risk being wasteful and counterproductive. This is recognized by the government, which aims to promote more employment-intensive growth. The government has also pursued the route of affirmative action to address historic inequities, but the Black Economic Empowerment initiative (BEE) to this end has often been criticised for primarily enriching a small number of already well-off blacks rather than raising the incomes of the poor.

The large current account deficit is the main source of macroeconomic vulnerability

Since 2003, South Africa's current account deficit has grown steadily, reaching 9% of GDP in the first quarter of 2008. Such levels, though high, are not extreme by international standards, but they do expose South Africa to the risk of a financial crisis associated with a sudden stop of capital inflows. This risk remains moderate, given that South Africa's net foreign liabilities are still modest and that debt in particular is very low, with a large proportion of the net capital inflows having so far come in the form of equity investment. Moreover, the deficit does not correspond to public dissaving, but to private savings-investment behaviour. On the other hand, the size and pace of increase of the deficits cast doubt on their sustainability, and recent experience across a range of countries shows that adjustments of external imbalances are often sudden and disruptive, and sometimes occur well before debt ratios get very large. Moreover, while increases in investment have been increasingly responsible for the widening of the current account deficit, South Africa's savings-investment gap has up until now mostly reflected not anomalously strong investment but unusually low savings. This is more suggestive of a consumption boom than of an inflow of capital to exploit attractive investment returns.

AsgiSA, the current national development strategy, represents a well-designed approach...

The formulation of AsgiSA was in many ways a courageous process. The government consulted widely with social partners and sought international expert opinion on economic development. The result was a strategy that first identified a limited number of constraints to faster and more broadly shared growth, and then outlined a set of policy interventions to remove those constraints. The diagnosis of the constraints to growth is

broadly sensible. Deficiencies are identified in state organisation, capacity, and strategic leadership, along with high cost and low efficiency of the national logistics system and some infrastructure. The economy is rightly seen as suffering from a shortage of skilled labour, and high barriers to entry and low competition in some sectors of the economy. It is likewise persuasive that the regulatory environment could be improved, reducing the burden on small and medium-sized enterprises in particular. The identification of the strength and volatility of the rand as a key constraint is probably the least clear-cut of the identified constraints, at least at this time, since much of the appreciation of 2003-06 has been unwound of late, and to some extent volatility of the exchange rate reflects the variability of key export commodity prices.

... but the mapping from constraints to policies is not always convincing

While the policy interventions set out in AsgiSA are each aimed at addressing one or more of the identified constraints, in some cases the linkage between the constraint and the policy solution is weak, while in others the policy action looks insufficiently strong to remove the constraint to faster and more evenly shared growth. For example, the emphasis on industrial policies risks preserving the apartheid-era pattern of protected national champions insulated from foreign competition and enjoying high mark-ups. This runs counter to the acknowledged need to enhance the level of competition in the economy. Also, the emphasis on government programmes and initiatives is at odds with the recognition of failures of government planning, coordination, and administrative capacity as one of the constraints to achieving faster and more widely shared growth. In addition, in the area of education the focus appears too narrow, with comparatively little emphasis on improving basic education.

Rapid convergence to advanced country living standards requires not only raising employment...

South Africa's very low labour utilisation explains a large part of the gap of GDP per capita with the most advanced economies. Compared to other middle-income countries, South Africa has relatively strong average labour productivity, but extremely low employment. Although in the long-run sustained increases in living standards and convergence to the levels enjoyed by advanced countries will only be achieved via growth in labour productivity, this suggests that in the near term priority should be given to creating jobs for the millions of primarily low-skilled South Africans currently wanting work.

... but also boosting productivity by more competition-friendly regulation

South Africa's relatively strong average labour productivity is a direct consequence of a prolonged process of capital deepening under apartheid. This trend was accompanied by relatively slow growth of total factor productivity (TFP), in an environment of weak competition, extensive public sector involvement and trade isolation. Greater trade openness has led to increased competitive pressures and helped improve productivity

performance over the recent past, but a large gap still remains. There is strong international evidence that a competition-friendly regulatory environment can help to lift living standards in the long run through increases in labour productivity growth.

Competition-friendly regulatory reform would contribute to stronger productivity performance...

Strengthening competition can contribute a great deal to the achievement of improved resource allocation and technical efficiency. Robust competition in product markets improves firms' performance by stimulating capital deepening, innovation and better corporate management. Empirical work for South Africa confirms the pro-productivity effect of competition, and surveys of South African enterprises point to anti-competitive barriers and practices as a major impediment to innovation. As the estimation of an OECD product market regulation (PMR) indicator shows, South Africa's product market is very restricted by international standards, with high mark-ups and concentration in many sectors and relatively extensive state involvement in the economy. These findings highlight the potential contribution of competition-enhancing regulatory reforms to South Africa's long-term economic prospects. The support for such reforms, clearly expressed in AsgiSA, should therefore be translated into a comprehensive policy strategy: given the complementarities that exist among different elements of regulatory reform, the creation of a broad, coherent and systematic framework for the conduct of regulatory policy would generate synergies between different product market reforms. More vigorous competition, by depressing excessive margins, would also help contain inflationary pressures which are expected to remain severe for some while to come. Policies to strengthen domestic competition and increase openness to trade and direct investment thus promise substantial payoffs in a range of areas.

... and would also help improve labour market outcomes

The fact that employed workers are on average productive and well-paid compared to those in other middle-income countries while an extremely large part of the labour force is excluded from employment altogether is in part a function of weak product market competition in some sectors. The weakness of competition makes it possible for large incumbent firms to set high prices and make excess returns, which in turn makes it possible for them to pay wages above the competitive level without going out of business. It also makes strikes or other forms of withheld effort more costly for firms, making them more willing to pay a premium over the market-clearing wage rate. This fact provides a link between the issue of low labour utilisation and product market regulation. Although empirical evidence for South Africa is limited, the existence of large incumbent firms with monopoly power tends to be associated with lower output and employment and higher prices in the affected sectors. The erosion of excess returns accruing to incumbent firms would therefore be expected to result in higher output and a shrinkage of the wage premium enjoyed by employees of these firms. This would lead to increased employment in these sectors, as well as in other sectors using the output of industries with weak competition (such as monopolised network industries) as inputs.

Improving employment growth will require first and foremost unwinding some legacies of apartheid...

Some aspects of the unemployment problem are clearly related to legacies of the apartheid era. Notably, under apartheid the education system was not designed to provide the majority black population with the human capital necessary to perform skilled work. Blacks were even forbidden from some occupations, and were mainly recruited into manual labour or menial work. Although access to schooling for non-whites has commendably been increased and public financing per pupil has been largely equalised across the school system, serious defects remain which continue to impede the opportunities of historically disadvantaged groups and which contribute to the skills mismatch in the labour market. Also, too little has been done to unwind the spatial misallocation of workers - despite improvements, the marks of the homeland and township system remain visible in present settlement patterns. The long distances travelled for commuting and job search raise reservation wages and depress search activity. Another negative aspect of apartheid that has not been fully addressed in the past 14 years is the suppression of entrepreneurial initiative among the majority black population. In the formal sector, the attractiveness for skilled blacks of affirmative action positions in existing corporations under the BEE initiative hinders the creation of new small black-owned businesses. Meanwhile, the informal sector remains small for an economy of South Africa's average income level, and has absorbed surprisingly little of the surge in the supply of less-skilled labour. Many restrictions persist making it hard for informal businesses to operate. While efforts to eliminate informality may be understandable in the sense that formal sector jobs provide better pay and conditions, the emphasis should be on facilitating formal sector employment rather than on suppressing the informal sector, which would cut against the imperative of making rapid progress in reducing unemployment.

... and perhaps also addressing some features of labour markets that inhibit job creation

Work on OECD member economies provides robust evidence that various aspects of labour market institutions and policies can lead to higher unemployment. While not all of these features are relevant in the case of South Africa – for example, tax wedges in South Africa are relatively low and unemployment insurance is limited – the extent and persistence of high unemployment suggest that labour market policies can play a role in tackling the problem. Prominent among the common complaints heard about South Africa's labour market rigidities is the claim that firing costs are too high. While the computation of an OECD employment protection legislation (EPL) indicator suggests that in fact the laws are not particularly restrictive, it does seem that some aspects of the implementation of the regulations could be improved. Beyond EPL, the potentially negative labour demand consequences of strong trade unions (mainly focused on employed workers) and sectoral minimum wages, as well as possible disincentive effects on labour supply of the expanding system of social grants, warrant careful monitoring to ensure that social aims are being achieved without an undue negative impact on employment. Apart from actions to ease labour market rigidities, there may also be scope for more active measures to allow young

less-skilled blacks to gain an employment foothold, such as lengthening maximum allowable probation periods during which normal labour regulations don't apply, or expanding the system of wage subsidies for first-time workers.

Much scope remains for harnessing economic potential to serve social aims

While South Africa's problems are difficult and multi-faceted, a combination of sound macroeconomic policies with structural policies aimed at enhancing competition appear to be most promising to unleash the enormous potential of South-Africa's labour force and address social ambitions within the framework of a strongly growing economy.

Glossary

AsgiSA Accelerated and Shared Growth Initiative – South Africa

BBBEE Broad-based Black Economic Empowerment

BEE Black Economic Empowerment
BER Bureau of Economic Research
CAC Competition Appeal Court

CCMA Commission for Conciliation, Mediation and Arbitration

Conarb Combined conciliation and arbitration procedure

CPI Consumer price index

CPIX Consumer price index excluding mortgages

Development Bank of South Africa
DoC Department of Communications

DoT Department of Transport

DME Department of Mineral and Energy
DPE Department of Public Enterprises
DTI Department of Trade and Industry
EPL Employment protection legislation

ERP Effective rates of protection

FDI Foreign direct investment

FET Further Education and Training

FIFA Fédération Internationale de Football Association

FSB Financial Services Board
GDP Gross domestic product

GEAR Growth, Employment and Redistribution Strategy

ICASA Independent Communications Authority of South Africa

ILO International Labour Organisation
 IMF International Monetary Fund
 IPPs Independent power producers
 IRCC Import Rebate Credit Certificates

LFS Labour Force Survey

JIPSA Joint Initiative for Priority Skills Acquisition
MIDP Motor Industry Development Programme

NEER nominal effective exchange rate

NERSA National Energy Regulation of South Africa

NFLS National Freight Logistics Strategy
NIPF National Industrial Policy Framework

NPA National Ports Authority

NSDP National Skills Development Programme

OHS October Household Survey

PIRLS Progress in International Reading Literacy Study

PMR Product market regulation
PPI Producer price index
PPP Purchasing power parity

RCA Revealed comparative advantage

RCP Road Carrier Permit

RDP Reconstruction and Development Programme

REDS Regional Electricity Distributors
REER Real effective exchange rate
RIA Regulatory Impact Assessment
SARB South African Reserve Bank

SARCCSouth African Rail Commuter CorporationSEESurvey of Employment and EarningsSETAsSector Education and Training Authorities

SLP Social and Labour Plan

SMEs Small and medium-sized enterprises

SMMEs Small, micro- and medium-sized enterprises

SOEs State-owned enterprises
TFP Total factor productivity

UNIDO UN Industrial Development Organization

USAASA Universal Service and Access Agency of South Africa

WEF World Economic Forum
WTO World Trade Organisation

Table of contents

Executive summary	9
Chapter 1. Achieving accelerated and shared growth for South Africa The origins of AsgiSA. Macroeconomic performance since 1994. The AsgiSA constraints and interventions. How AsgiSA could be strengthened to improve the chances of meeting the government's key goals. Notes. Bibliography. Annex 1.A1. Black Economic Empowerment (BEE).	177 188 199 377 444 477 488 500
Chapter 2. Reforming goods and services markets in South Africa The role of competition in enhancing productivity An assessment of product market regulation in South Africa The role of institutional and regulatory reform in enhancing competition Notes Bibliography	555 566 633 711 798 838 8789 98
Chapter 3. Realising South Africa's employment potential Diagnosing unemployment in South Africa. Labour market performance. Reasons for the inability to absorb the increase in labour supply Policies to tackle unemployment Notes Bibliography Annex 3.A1. The assessment of EPL in South Africa	106 115 126 129 131
Boxes 1.1. The AsgiSA constraints	38 72 78 111

Tables		
1.1.	Revealed comparative advantages	31
1.A1.1.	National BBBEE scorecard	51
2.1.	Summary indicators of product-market regulation	65
2.A1.1.	C5% concentration index for South African manufacturing industry	87
2.A1.2.	Rosenbluth concentration index for South African manufacturing industry	88
3.1.	Unemployment rate, 15-65 years	108
3.2.	Working-age population and labour force	112
3.3.	An employment equation for South Africa, 1995 and 2005	121
3.4.	Union and bargaining council wage premia – earnings function estimates	125
Figures		
1.1.	GDP per capita in PPP terms	19
1.2.	Labour productivity, capital accumulation and GDP per capita	20
1.3.	Real per capita GDP growth rates, 1994-2003 and 2004-06	21
1.4.	The terms of trade	22
1.5.	Command GDP and consumption	23
1.6.	Public finances	24
1.7.	Public debt to GDP	24
1.8.	Inflation	25
1.9.	Inflation expectations	26
1.10.	Nominal and real effective exchange rate variability, 1995-2005	27
1.11.	Fluctuations in commodity prices and the nominal effective exchange rate	28
1.12.	Current account developments	29
1.13.	Savings as a proportion of GDP, 2006	30
1.14.	South African exports – world market share	30
1.15.	Gini coefficient	32
1.16.	Progress on reducing unemployment, 2004-14	33
1.17.	Worsening relative bond spreads in early 2008 – an Eskom effect?	34
1.18.	Enrolment rates at primary, secondary, and tertiary levels	36
1.19.	Real effective exchange rate	40
2.1.	Labour productivity and TFP growth	57
2.2.	Productivity, real wage growth and export competitiveness indicators	59
2.3.	Highly important factors that hampered innovation	60
2.4.	Broadband advertised speed and monthly subscription price	62
2.5.	Tariffs and non-tariff barriers	63
2.6.	Aggregate product-market regulation indicator	65
2.7.	Product market regulation in energy, transport and communication	67
2.8.	FDI restrictiveness index.	68
2.9.	Factors inhibiting business growth	69
2.10.	Regulatory compliance cost as a percentage of turnover	71
2.11.	FDI inflows as a percentage of GDP, average 2000-06	77
2.A2.1.	The PMR indicator system	90
2.A2.2.	Scope of public enterprise	91
2.A2.3.	Size of public sector	91
2.A2.4.	Direct control over business enterprises	92
2.A2.5.	Price controls	92
2.A2.6.	Command and control regulation	92

2.A2.7.	Communication and simplification	93
2.A2.8.	Licenses and permits	93
2.A2.9.	Start-up: corporations	94
2.A2.10.	Start-up: sole proprietors	94
2.A2.11.	Sector-specific administrative burdens	94
2.A2.12.	Legal barriers to entry	95
2.A2.13.	Antitrust exemptions	95
2.A2.14.	Barriers to foreign ownership	96
2.A2.15.	Tariffs	96
2.A2.16.	Discriminatory procedures	96
2.A2.17.	Regulatory barriers to trade	97
3.1.	Unemployment rate, 2006	
3.2.	Unemployment rates for different racial groups, 2000-07	
3.3.	Long-term unemployment	109
3.4.	Labour force participation rates, 1995 and 2006	
3.5.	Working-age population growth in selected countries, 1995-2000	
3.6.	Employment, 1995-2007	
3.7.	Employment intensity of growth, 2003-07	114
3.8.	Urbanisation	117
3.9.	International Tests of Scholastic Achievement	119
3.10.	Employment protection legislation	122
3.11.	EPL – ease of firing	123
3.12.	Trade union density	124
3.A1.1.	Procedural inconveniences	135
3.A1.2.	Notice and severance pay for no-fault individual dismissals	136
3.A1.3.	Difficulty of dismissal	136
3.A1.4.	Fixed term contracts	137
3.A1.5.	Temporary work agency employment	138
3.A1.6.	Collective dismissals	138

This report was prepared in the Economics Department by Geoff Barnard and Christian Gianella, under the supervision of Andreas Wörgötter.

Substantial contributions were made by the following individuals: Haroon Bhorat (labour markets), Johannes Fedderke (competition), Tatiana Lysenko (network industries), and Cornel van Basten (network industries).

Technical assistance was provided by Corinne Chanteloup and secretarial assistance by Susan Gascard and Josiane Gutierrez.

The report was discussed at a meeting of the Economic and Development Review Committee on 19 May 2008 with Professor Philippe Aghion and Professor Murray Leibbrandt acting as external discussants.

This book has...



Look for the *StatLinks* at the bottom right-hand corner of the tables or graphs in this book. To download the matching Excel® spreadsheet, just type the link into your Internet browser, starting with the *http://dx.doi.org* prefix.

If you're reading the PDF e-book edition, and your PC is connected to the Internet, simply click on the link. You'll find *StatLinks* appearing in more OECD books.

BASIC STATISTICS OF SOUTH AFRICA

(2007, unless otherwise noted)

THE LAND

THE LAND								
Area (thousand sq. km)	1 221							
THE PEOPLE								
Population (millions, mid-year)	47.9	Labour force (thousands, 15-65, Sept.)	17 178					
Provinces (% of total population)		Employment (% of total)						
Eastern Cape	14.4	Agriculture	8.8					
Free State	6.2	Industry and construction	26.0					
Gauteng	20.2	Services	65.2					
KwaZulu-Natal	20.9							
Limpopo	11.3							
Mpumalanga	7.4							
Northern Cape	2.3							
North West	7.1							
Western Cape	10.1							
Annual population growth (%, 2001-07)	1.1							
Inhabitants per sq. km	39.2							
GRO	SS DOME	STIC PRODUCT						
Gross domestic product		Gross value added (% of total)						
In rand billion	1 994	Agriculture	3.2					
Per capita (USD, PPP, 2006)	9 087	Industry and construction	31.3					
		Services	65.5					
	PUBLIC	FINANCES						
General government (% of GDP)		Public debt (% of GDP)	30.6					
Revenue	26.6							
Expenditure	26.0							
	FOREIG	N TRADE						
Exports of goods and services (% of GDP)	31.6	Imports of goods and services (% of total)	34.7					
Main commodity exports (% of total, 2006)		Main commodity imports (% of total, 2006)						
Machinery and transport equipment	21.5	Machinery and transport equipment	37.8					
Non-ferrous metals	20.6	Manufactured goods and articles	19.9					
Iron and steel	10.8	Mineral fuels	18.3					
Crude materials, inedible, except fuels	10.3	Chemicals	8.9					
THE CURRENCY								
Monetary unit: Rand		Rand per USD (period average):	7.05					



From:

OECD Economic Surveys: South Africa 2008

Access the complete publication at:

https://doi.org/10.1787/eco_surveys-zaf-2008-en

Please cite this chapter as:

OECD (2008), "Executive summary", in *OECD Economic Surveys: South Africa 2008*, OECD Publishing, Paris.

DOI: https://doi.org/10.1787/eco_surveys-zaf-2008-2-en

This work is published under the responsibility of the Secretary-General of the OECD. The opinions expressed and arguments employed herein do not necessarily reflect the official views of OECD member countries.

This document and any map included herein are without prejudice to the status of or sovereignty over any territory, to the delimitation of international frontiers and boundaries and to the name of any territory, city or area.

You can copy, download or print OECD content for your own use, and you can include excerpts from OECD publications, databases and multimedia products in your own documents, presentations, blogs, websites and teaching materials, provided that suitable acknowledgment of OECD as source and copyright owner is given. All requests for public or commercial use and translation rights should be submitted to rights@oecd.org. Requests for permission to photocopy portions of this material for public or commercial use shall be addressed directly to the Copyright Clearance Center (CCC) at info@copyright.com or the Centre français d'exploitation du droit de copie (CFC) at contact@cfcopies.com.

